



**SUMMARY OF FINDINGS**  
**Report of the Child, Youth and Family Pay and Employment**  
**Equity Review**

# Table of Contents

---

- Section 1: Introduction .....3
  - 1.1 : The Review .....6
- Section 2 : Summary of Findings of the PaEE Review .....9
  - 2.1: Occupational Segregation..... 14
  - 2. 2 : Female Dominated Job Categories..... 15
  - 2.3 : Impact on Social Work ..... 16

# Section 1: Introduction

---

**This report**

This report provides a summary of the findings of the Pay and Employment Equity (PaEE) Review conducted by the Pay and Employment Equity (PaEE) Review Committee within Child, Youth and Family (CYF).

It is intended to be read in conjunction with the PaEE Response Plan which sets out the proposed strategies for achieving gender based employment equity within CYF.

---

**Audience**

This summary of findings is addressed to:

- CYF employees
  - CYF Executive Committee
  - MSD Leadership Team
  - Philippa Hall, Director of Pay and Employment Equity Unit, Department of Labour
  - State Services Commission.
- 

*Continued on next page*

## Section 1: Introduction, Continued

---

### Associated documents

The following documents are associated with this summary of findings:

- Report on the Taskforce on Pay and Employment Equity in the Public Service and the Public Health and Public Education Sector, March 2004.
- Application for Contestable Funding, 19 August 2005
- Working Towards Pay and Employment For Women, January 2006, Department of Labour.
- Steering Group Terms of Reference, Pay and Employment Equity Review, 16 March 2006.
- Project Terms of Reference, Pay and Employment Equity Audit, V3, 3 April 2006.
- Pay and Employment Equity Review Committee Terms of Reference, 6 July 2006.
- Proposal for Online Survey, Pay and Employment Equity Review, 15 August 2006.
- Memorandum of Understanding Between Child, Youth and Family and the Department of Labour, 21 February 2006 and Letter of Variation, 26 September 2006.
- The Pay and Employment Equity Response Plan.

---

*Continued on next page*

## Section 1: Introduction, Continued

---

### Background

The PaEE Review is a key strategy relating to the implementation of the Government's five year Action Plan to address gender based pay and employment equity within the state sector including the public service sector, health and education sectors.

In 2004 the Associate Minister of Labour launched the Pay and Employment Equity Unit (PEEU) to manage the implementation of the Action Plan across the state sector. At this time the Minister stated that joint ownership of both the processes and responses between the unions and the employers was essential. It was also proposed that PaEE Reviews would provide a real opportunity to gather and analyse information and that existing processes such as collective bargaining and accountability mechanisms would be used to implement creative and practical solutions. There was the expectation that real benefits can be derived from the PaEE Review when people are treated fairly and their needs are taken into account.<sup>1</sup>

Two years on CYF is part of the initial group of public service organisations that have undertaken the PaEE Review.

The establishment of a PaEE Review Committee and the subsequent PaEE Review itself was partially funded from PaEE contestable funding administered by PEEU of the Department of Labour.

The purpose of the PaEE Review Committee was to conduct an enquiry into the occupational position and pay status of female employees within CYF to identify any gender based disparities or differences that require adjustment through a Response Plan.

The parties to the PaEE Review and the Response Plan include CYF as the employer and the unions representing the employees.<sup>2</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> The Hon Ruth Dyson's speech at the launch of the Pay and Employment Equity Unit, Department of Labour, 16 December 2004.

<sup>2</sup> The unions include Public Service Association (PSA) and NUPE.

## 1.1 : The Review

---

### **The importance of the PaEE Review**

The terms of reference for the PaEE Review, broadly stated, included the investigation into gender based pay and employment equity within CYF. The aim was to identify both direct and indirect forms of gender based disparity and to devise strategies and a partnership based Response Plan to address these. Areas where CYF is already performing well were also to be acknowledged.

The organisational context within CYF represents what is typically termed 'horizontal inequality'.<sup>3</sup> As a form of occupational segregation, this is reflected by both CYF gender ratios and the rate of female participation within certain occupational groups and position titles. For example, 76 percent of CYF employees are female and while they are represented within all CYF job categories, most are clustered in a relatively narrow range of female intensive occupations.

Eighty four percent of all females employed in CYF are in 7 female dominated job categories compared to 57 percent of males in the same categories. Males represent 24 percent of the CYF employee population and 43 percent of this group are in the job categories designated as 'gender neutral'.<sup>4</sup> Only 23 percent of females employed in CYF are in the gender neutral job categories.

This gender based demography along with a recognised prevalence of lower pay rates in the female intensive job categories provided the PaEE Review with a context for understanding and identifying gender inequities.<sup>5</sup>

At the outset Social Work was regarded as an important job category within CYF. For the purposes of the PaEE Review the Social Work Job category included the positions of front line Social Workers, Adoptions Social Workers, Call Centre Social Workers, and Residential Social Workers.<sup>6</sup>

---

*Continued on next page*

---

<sup>3</sup> Report on the Taskforce on Pay And Employment Equity in the Public Service and the Public Health and Public Education Sector, March 2004.

<sup>4</sup> The threshold for female dominated job categories is >70 percent female representation and the threshold of male dominated is >60 percent. Job categories that do not meet the threshold for either are designated 'gender neutral'.

<sup>5</sup> Report on the Taskforce on Pay And Employment Equity in the Public Service and the Public Health and Public Education Sector, March 2004.

<sup>6</sup> For the purposes of the PaEE Review the Social Work job category was based on a remuneration model. It excludes Supervisors and Senior Practitioners, both of which are treated as separate job categories.

## 1.1 : The Review, Continued

---

**The importance of the PaEE Review**  
(continued)

Not only is the Social Work grouping the single largest job category within CYF, but the PaEE Review is a way to ensure all staff are positively valued. Furthermore, it is noted that the outcomes of the PaEE Review were expected to contribute to the wider platform for addressing issues of recruitment and retention of qualified Social Workers in relation to perceived labour market shortages.

This imperative has been reinforced by additional factors such as the future impacts of social demographics and workforce development.

These are all compelling drivers for addressing pay and employment equity within CYF.<sup>7</sup>

---

**The mandate**

The PaEE Review and the establishment of the PaEE Review Committee is a requirement within the Department of Labour, Pay and Employment Equity Unit funded project to implement a PaEE Review within CYF Services.<sup>8</sup>

The term of the project is for nine months from 8 May 2006 to 28 February 2007.

This report on the summary of findings is part of the contractual requirements.

---

*Continued on next page*

---

<sup>7</sup> Refer to the CYF application for Contestable Funding, 19 August 2005, and Memorandum of Understanding Between Child, Youth and Family and the Department of Labour, 21 February 2006.

<sup>8</sup> Funding for the state sector is set up as a Contestable Fund, managed by the Pay and Employment Equity Unit in the Department of Labour and available to unions and employers to undertake PaEE Reviews. CYF was successful in achieving funding in the 2005-2006 round to undertake the internal PaEE Review.

## 1.1 : The Review, Continued

---

### **The PaEE Review Committee**

The PaEE Review was carried out by an internal PaEE Review Committee comprising eight members.

As a group, the membership covered knowledge of most areas of the organisation including remuneration. The membership was also representative of the main occupational groups and/or groups that were considered to have significant pay and employment equity issues, the business groups, and regional groups. The group included three Public Service Association members.

All PaEE Review Committee members participated in the Department of Labour training on Pay and Employment Equity Reviews.

Meetings were held on a fortnightly basis and were 4 hours in duration, with the exception of two one-day workshops.

---

# Section 2 : Summary of Findings of the PaEE Review

---

**Positive findings**

The findings of the PaEE Review positively indicate that:

- Females participate at all levels of the organisation. When they are in the higher paid Management positions they receive all benefits and rewards commensurate with the work they do.
  - Females are likely to experience the same rate of success as males do when applying for promotion or a senior position.
  - Fair treatment and a supportive approach by individual managers have a positive impact on female staff. Employees, especially females, who are treated well are more likely to also express job satisfaction and loyalty to CYF.
- 

**Factors contributing to disparities**

The summary of the PaEE Review shows there are two key factors that contribute to disparities and differences in pay between females and males in CYF. These are:

1. Internal policies and practices
  2. Occupational segregation.
- 

**Pay equity**

The overall pattern and trend is that males in CYF are paid more than females. The average FTE male earnings is \$5,153 or 9.5 percent higher than the female average FTE earnings.

The aggregated earnings data shows that occupational segregation as a form of horizontal inequality is a contributing factor in the gender pay gap between females and males in CYF.

The following pay and employment equity issues suggest that the female pay disparities may be addressed through a pay investigation of significantly impacted job categories.

1. The organisational salary distribution for females is lower compared to males within all ranges of the distribution. This is skewed and weighted by a combination of the following factors:
    - a trend of lower female starting salaries
    - low minimum pay ranges in female dominated job categories
    - disproportionate representation of males in gender neutral categories
    - the remunerative undervaluing of the Social Work job category.
- 

*Continued on next page*

## Section 2 : Summary of Findings of the PaEE Review, Continued

---

### **Pay and internal policies & practices**

The following pay equity issues require addressing through a change in internal policies and practices.

2. The organisational salary distribution for females is lower compared to males within all ranges of the distribution. This is skewed by a combination of (1) a trend of lower female starting salaries, (2) low minimum pay ranges in female dominated job categories, (3) disproportionate representation of males in gender neutral categories.
3. Females in the gender neutral management categories earn less than males. The differentials are skewed in favour of males within all ranges of the salary distribution. This can be attributed to (1) lower female starting salaries and (2) disproportionate representation of males relative to their overall CYF gender ratio.
4. Female starting salaries are lower than males in Social Work for both qualified and unqualified social workers.

---

*Continued on next page*

## Section 2 : Summary of Findings of the PaEE Review, Continued

---

**Pay and internal policies & practices**  
(continued)

- 5. Female median pay is lower than the pay range midpoint for Social Workers and Practice Leaders - even when qualified and tenured 4+ years.
  - 6. Sixty three percent of all qualified Social Workers who have 4+ years tenure are paid below the midpoint of the pay range. Overall, this implies an underpayment and unfair salary for 10.6 percent (number 117) of Social Workers. This group can be expected to have reached midpoint within this time frame.<sup>9</sup>
  - 7. A group of Social Workers has been identified as being paid below the minimum rate of pay and a further and larger group of qualified Social Workers are paid below the starting rate on the pay range.
  - 8. There is variation in Social Work female starting salaries within regions and between sites. Also the female median salary in 30 sites is lower than the overall Social Work median salary and the male median salary is higher than the females on 23 sites.
- 

**Impacts on salary**

- 9. The rate of fixed term agreements contributes to the lower salary distribution for female social workers. For example, it impacts on the lower female starting salaries and lower 25th percentile distribution range.
- 

*Continued on next page*

---

<sup>9</sup> See the PSA Collect Agreement (1 July 2005) on the guidelines for remuneration of satisfactory performance pp 22-24 and pp 74 – 75.

## Section 2 : Summary of Findings of the PaEE Review, Continued

---

### Participation

10. A trend for males to be disproportionately represented in the gender neutral job categories relative to their CYF gender ratio. Lower rates of female participation in all gender neutral job categories in comparison to their over gender ratio.
11. Some staff returning from Parental Leave are disadvantaged by a change of employment status and/or position resulting in loss of pay, benefits and entitlements, career prospects, advancement, performance appraisal and pay progression. This has an impact on female staff who are more likely than males to take Parental Leave.
12. Work life balance and flexible working options are allocated inconsistently and variably resulting in disadvantage to some staff, particularly females. This also has implications for productivity issues in future planning.
13. Low levels of recruitment of females in Lead Advisor/Analysts and Senior Advisor/Analyst job categories.
14. A low rate of progression of females from Social Worker into Practice Leader positions.
15. High turnover for female psychologists.
16. Gender role differentiation - female Family Group Coordinators (FGCs) tend to be confined to Care and Protection roles.
17. Limited development and career options for staff in Administration especially Social Work Resource Assistants (SWRAs).
18. Female staff are not always aware of opportunities for advancement or promotion.
19. Females report a lower rate of participation/representation on committees and projects.
20. There are age related differences in earnings and tenure. For example, remuneration rates for females peak earlier than males at the age band 50-54 years with a gradual decline with subsequent ageing bands. The decline is consistent with tenure.
21. A trend in the allocation of discretionary payments for males to be disproportionately represented relative to their CYF gender ratio.

---

*Continued on next page*

## Section 2 : Summary of Findings of the PaEE Review, Continued

---

**Fairness and respect**

- 22. Performance Appraisal outcomes - staff perceive the performance pay systems to be arbitrarily and inconsistently applied and that outcomes do not always reward competency. The survey responses indicate this may reduce staff morale.
  - 23. A perceived detrimental work environment where some staff have experienced negative interactions such as 'bullying' by peers and managers.
  - 24. Lack of clarity on policy for complaints on bullying and lack of confidence in CYF managers to address complaints.
-

## 2.1: Occupational Segregation

---

### **Occupational segregation**

Occupational segregation reflects a wider social concern about the way in which females tend to be clustered into 'female typed' occupations that are undervalued and low paid.

Occupational segregation as a form of 'horizontal inequality' is a contributing factor in the pay differences between female and male employees in CYF and in particular it is reflected in female dominated job categories.<sup>10</sup>

Social Work is the largest job category in CYF and comprises the largest group of female CYF employees. This female population is even further increased if the job categories comprised within the social work professional career pathway are combined such as Supervisors and Practice Leaders. This female predominance has a significant impact on the female pay distribution and pay equity outcomes for CYF females.

In summary, the solution to the problem of horizontal inequality is in part, beyond the scope of CYF and reliant upon external processes. The PaEE Review guidelines recommend that pay investigations may be one approach to evaluating the comparative worth and value of a job category in relation to its occupational grouping.<sup>11</sup>

Specific issues that can be addressed internally within CYF are included in the Response Plan and strategies.

---

---

<sup>10</sup> Report on the Taskforce on Pay And Employment Equity in the Public Service and the Public Health and Public Education Sector, March 2004.

<sup>11</sup> Ibid

## 2. 2 : Female Dominated Job Categories

---

### Female dominated job categories

Female dominated job categories typically have a high rate of female participation associated with low pay ranges and tend to not be recognised of comparable worth to the organisation in terms of the amount of skill, degree of effort and level of responsibility as male dominated job categories.

- Within CYF the Administration and Social Work job categories are characteristic of female dominated job categories. Both these job categories have a weighted impact on the overall organisational salary distribution for females within CYF, skewing the outcomes in favour of males.
- The Administration job category has a significant impact on the overall organisational female salary distribution within CYF. It is numerically dominated by females comprising 93 percent and the second largest job category within CYF.
- The Administration job category is associated with low paid including low minimum pay ranges and a narrow pay range compared to other CYF job categories.
- The Social Work job category also has a significant impact on the overall organisational female salary distribution within CYF. It is numerically dominated by females comprising 80 percent and is the largest job category within CYF. This reflects an occupational trend across the social service and welfare sector.
- The Social Work job category is associated with low pay including low minimum pay ranges and an extended pay range with a relatively low maximum rate compared with other social work based job categories in CYF.<sup>12</sup>
- The Social Work job category is regarded as an important job category both because it is essential to the delivery of service for CYF and because the findings of the PaEE Review have confirmed that issues relating to pay and employment equity within the Social Work job category require priority attention. Furthermore, it meets the criteria of an occupational group that may be remuneratively undervalued compared to its organisational significance and the basis of education and skill required to carry out the role.
- As a female dominated job category the minority of males (20 percent) in Social Work are also expected to experience some of the detrimental impacts females are subjected to. This does not diminish the impact or importance of equity issues for females.

---

<sup>12</sup> The pay rates of social workers are considered low compared to other Professionals and Associated Professionals. (November 2005) Department of Labour report " Social Worker: Occupational Skills Shortage".

## 2.3 : Impact on Social Work

---

### **The impact on Social Work**

There are several factors that either on their own or together contribute to the PaEE impact on Social Work and result in unfair outcomes for Social Work as a female dominated job category.

The following factors have the effect of maintaining salaries at the minimum or lower rate and dragging the overall salary distribution for females in CYF down:

- low starting salaries for females
- a high rate of fixed term agreements (highest rate in CYF)
- variable and inconsistent pay progression to midpoint of the pay range
- variable and inconsistent outcomes affecting the pay and employment status and position of returnees from Parental Leave.

The remuneration system as it is set out and applied to the Social Work job category has flexibilities that have indirectly led to unfair outcomes. These are:

- low minimum rates within the pay range
- a wider pay range leading to the midpoint (66 percent at \$33.379 – to 100 percent at \$50.068)

Other organisational factors have contributed to the lower salary distribution. This is because they have the effect of maintaining the salary distribution for Social Workers within the lower end of the pay range. These are:

- a high rate of unqualified Social Workers at 50 percent of the job category and slow progress to achieve qualification<sup>13</sup>
  - a consistent turnover of Social Workers within the first 2-4 years of tenure – 30 percent within each two-year period.
- 

<sup>13</sup> It is noted that the work load of a social worker is onerous and this may place a limitation on an unqualified social worker's ability to achieve a qualification in a shorter timeframe given the demands of the role.