



RESPONSE PLAN
Report Of The Child, Youth And Family Pay And Employment
Equity Review

Published June 2008

Response Plan and Initiatives for Pay and Employment Equity

This plan

This plan is based on the findings of the Pay and Employment Equity (PaEE) Review conducted in the Child Youth and Family (CYF) during 2006/07. The plan should be read in conjunction with the report on the summary of findings of the Review.

The PaEE Review was carried out by a Pay and Employment Equity Review Committee comprising of Child, Youth and Family and Public Service Association representatives.

The mandate for the PaEE Review and Terms of Reference for the Review Committee are based on the requirements set out in the Memorandum of Understanding (21 February 2006) between Child, Youth and Family and the Department of Labour. The PaEE Review was funded as part of a government initiative to address gender inequities in pay and employment within the state sector.

For the purposes of the PaEE Review the Review Committee applied processes consistent with the Department of Labour guidelines.

This plan identifies the significant PaEE issues identified by the Review Committee together with the proposed actions to address the matters raised. The overall intention of the plan is to respond to those issues that the Committee identified as having the most potential to achieve pay and employment equity for female staff over time. It follows that progress should be monitored over time to track whether CYF enjoys a greater level of pay and employment equity for its female staff.

The initiatives

The initiatives contained within this response plan are based on the premise that women and men should have equitable opportunities to access rewards, to participation at all levels, to receive fair and respectful treatment, and that any gender differences in the distribution of organisational rewards, participation levels and experiences of respect and fairness are explainable and justifiable.

The most significant initiative identified within this plan is that related to a pay investigation in relation to the social work job family. Because of the significance of this action, a detailed case for proceeding with such an investigation is set out separate to the other initiatives.

Continued on next page

Response Plan and Initiatives for Pay and Employment Equity,

Continued

Equity indicators

The findings of the PaEE Review are organised in relation to four Pay and Employment Equity indicators.¹ These are detailed below.

1. Indicator 1: Gender Pay.

This indicator refers to the earnings, both remunerative and non remunerative benefits and rewards, and whether women and men receive an equitable share and whether they advance at a similar or the same rates to higher levels of pay in the organisation.

2. Indicator 2: Impacts on Salary.

This indicator refers to the formal and informal practices, policies and procedures that contribute to the disadvantage and disparate impacts on the pay women receive.

3. Indicator 3: Participation.

This indicator refers to whether women are represented across all job categories and work areas, and whether they have equitable access to training and development for the purpose of career advancement. It also includes whether women actively make a contribution through advice and influence to important areas of the organisation, and if there is support for work life balance at all levels.

4. Indicator 4: Respect and Fairness.

This indicator refers to the confidence women have that the treatment they receive from managers is fair and equitable and that organisational policy and practices minimise the risk of discrimination and harassment and other inappropriate behaviors. It also includes whether women have confidence in the fairness of the human resource policies and systems and whether the performance management system is fair.

Continued on next page

¹ The terms of reference within the government plan of action and Department of Labour guidelines required the PaEE Review to assess the organisation's success in relation to four equity indicators. The government plan of action is contained within the Report of the Taskforce on Pay and Employment Equity in the Public Service and the Public Health and Public Education Sectors (March 2004). The PaEE Review guidelines are contained within Working Towards Pay and Employment Equity for Women, Department of Labour, 2nd Edition (January 2006).

Response Plan and Initiatives for Pay and Employment Equity, Continued

The goal The goal of this Response Plan is to achieve gender equity outcomes in both pay and employment opportunities and outcomes within Child, Youth and Family.

Objectives The objectives of this Response Plan are to:

- rectify any aspects of gender based disadvantage and/or disparity identified within specified job categories and/or position titles.
- promote and enhance the status and worth of Social Work as a female dominated job category, and as a front line service within CYF, by ensuring the value of the skills, responsibilities, effort and other job components are reflected in the actual pay and benefits received.
- address any formal or informal practices, policies, and/or procedures contributing to the disadvantage and disparate impacts on female dominated job categories, and/or female employees as a group.
- promote and enhance opportunities and broaden the range of participation within the Administration job category as a female dominated job category, along with ensuring the value of the skills, responsibilities, effort and other job components are reflected in the actual pay and benefits received.
- ensure equity for women is achieved in senior and management job categories and/or position titles as measured by a better consistency with gender ratios within the overall organisation.
- promote and enhance a culture of respect in the working environment by addressing behaviors that are detrimental to positive interactions between staff such as 'bullying'.

Continued on next page

Response Plan and Initiatives for Pay and Employment Equity, Continued

Reporting

For the purposes of monitoring the implementation of this plan and for tracking progress to achieve pay and employment equity, the Manager Organisational Development will be responsible for providing six monthly progress reports to the CYF Executive Committee.

Pay Investigation – Social Work

Purpose

The purpose of a Pay Investigation is to:

1. identify whether the job category is evaluated to require the same amount of skills, responsibility and demand compared to male dominated job categories, and
 2. ascertain whether the remuneration of social work is equal to the remuneration of comparator male occupation(s) of equal measured job size.²
-

The criterion

The only set criterion for a Pay Investigation is that the occupational category is a female dominated occupation – that is, it meets the 70 percent threshold.³

Note: A proposal for a Pay Investigation is made as part of the Pay and Employment Equity (PaEE) Review Response plan. If anomalies within an occupational/job category are identified by a PaEE Review and these are considered sufficiently linked to occupational segregation a recommendation for a Pay Investigation can be made.⁴

Continued on next page

² Refer to discussion in Freeman ML., 'Pay Equity and Social Work' in AFFLIA, Vol.6 No 1, Spring 1991 7-19

³ Department of Labour guidelines, January 2006., "Working Towards Pay and Employment Equity For Women." See also Report of the Task Force on Pay and Employment Equity in the Public Service and the Public Health and Public Education Sectors, March 2004.

⁴ Department of Labour guidelines, January 2006., "Working Towards Pay and Employment Equity For Women."

Pay Investigation – Social Work, Continued

The Case

The case for a Pay Investigation into the Social Work job category is:

- The Social Work job category within CYF meets the criteria for Pay Investigations - it is 80 percent female.
- The pay and employment equity review of CYF established apparent anomalies in the remuneration of social workers. The pay range and actual salary distribution for Social Work is inconsistent with the internal pay ranges of other professional and associate professional job categories.
- A gender pay gap shows up in the aggregated earnings data for women within CYF that is primarily (although not exclusively) attributable to a low salary distribution within Social Work and a comparatively low salary distribution in relation to gender neutral job categories.
- Within CYF the female median salary is the second lowest within the female dominated job categories.⁵ Also it is lower than eight out of ten gender neutral job categories.⁶
- Social work has many of the characteristics associated with undervaluation of female dominated occupations. The requirements/competencies for the job have historically relied upon human relations skills that have been regarded as “natural” attributes rather than developed through learning, practice and experience.⁷
- Undervaluation is often produced and sustained through gender segregation of occupations, and social work is a gender segregated occupation.
- In some female dominated occupations, such as Social Work, increased job demands have led to increased qualifications requirements that have not been fully recognised in remuneration increases.
- Appropriate and relevant male comparator professional occupations are not sufficiently available internally within CYF to allow robust comparisons of remuneration of male and female dominated jobs of comparable measured size.

Continued on next page

⁵ Administrative job category is the lowest. This reflects the lower pay range and lower minimum pay range.

⁶ Specialist Support and the Residential/Domestic job categories are the two lowest of the gender neutral job categories.

⁷ Department of Labour guidelines, January 2006., “ Working Towards Pay and Employment Equity For Women.” See also Report of the Task Force on Pay and Employment Equity in the Public Service and the Public Health and Public Education Sectors, March 2004.

Pay Investigation – Social Work, Continued

The Case (continued)

- Change in internal practices and policies will not address any undervaluation of the Social Work occupation that arises from the labour market characteristics of the whole occupation and its industrial history in remuneration setting.
- There is evidence from New Zealand research that social workers are paid less than other professionals. For example, a study on workforce capability showed that the Social Work remuneration levels had fallen behind professional groups such as police and nurses.⁸ Another study by the Department of Labour on the Social Worker Occupational Skills Shortage showed that Social Workers were paid an average hourly rate below that of other professional and associate professional groups.⁹
- There are continuing shortages of social workers that are not just a training issue. Shortages in the occupation also often indicate remuneration does not match the value of the required skills, knowledge, responsibility and demands of an occupation.¹⁰
- Successful pay equity cases in Australia have been won on the basis that the human services skills in social work were under-recognised and underpaid. For example, in the Social Workers' Case the adequacy of descriptions for "soft" skills (those used in services, especially human services work) was considered.¹¹

Continued on next page

⁸ Martin Jenkins and Associates, Child, Youth and Family Workforce Capability Development Strategy, June 2004.

⁹ Source, Labour Cost Index, Statistics New Zealand cited in 'Social Worker: Occupational Skill Shortage Assessment', Department of Labour, November 2005.

¹⁰ Department of Labour, Social Worker: Occupational Skill Shortage Assessment, November 2005.

¹¹ Professional Officers Association Australian Government Employment, Professional and Executive Salaries Award 1990 27 June 1997 Print P2275.

Pay Investigation – Social Work, Continued

Summary

In summary, there is a sound basis to investigate whether the Social Work job category is properly evaluated and appropriately remunerated.

Examination of enterprise and occupation level factors is likely to be necessary and therefore before proceeding, the feasibility of the pay investigation being carried out on an occupational basis across the wider State sector should be explored before proceeding.

It is therefore proposed that the feasibility study be initiated immediately with a pay investigation to be completed within 12 months of concluding that study.

Accountability for the pay investigation should rest with the Deputy Chief Executive CYF.

Initiatives

1. Gender Pay

- Rectify any aspects of gender based disadvantage and/or disparity identified within specified job categories and/or position titles.
- Promote and enhance the status and worth of Social Work as a female dominated job category, and as a front line service within CYF, by ensuring the value of the skills, responsibilities, effort and other job components are reflected in the actual pay and benefits received.
- Ensure equity for women is achieved in senior and management job categories and/or position titles as measured by a better consistency with gender ratios within the overall organisation.

#	PaEE ISSUE	INITIATIVE	TIME FRAMES	ACCOUNTABILITY	UP DATE
1	Females in the gender neutral management categories earn less than males. The differentials are skewed in favour of males within all ranges of the salary distribution. This can be attributed to (1) lower females starting salaries and (2) disproportionate representation of males relative to their overall gender ratio.	<p>Clarify guidelines for managers in setting starting salaries for new appointees to management roles to ensure wherever possible focus is on demonstrated previous competency relevant to the role.</p> <p>Ensure female staff have access to leadership and management related training and that they are actively supported to explore career progression opportunities.</p>	<p>Guidelines reviewed by 28 March 2008</p> <p>On-going</p>	<p>Manager Organisational Development</p> <p>Manager Organisational Development</p>	IN PROGRESS
2	Female median pay is lower than the pay range midpoint for Social Workers and Practice Leaders – even when qualified and tenured 4 + years (sixty three percent (117) of all qualified social workers who have 4yrs + tenure are paid below the midpoint of the pay range).	Investigation into reasons behind these issues to be carried out and the appropriate remedies to be determined and implemented.	<p>Investigation to be undertaken and appropriate remedies developed and implemented by 12 December 2008.</p> <p>Ongoing consistency process for new PDS to be used to identify any inequities in outcomes going forward.</p>	Manager Organisational Development	IN PROGRESS

2. Impacts on Salary

- Address any formal or informal practices, policies, and/or procedures contributing to the disadvantage and disparate impacts on female dominated job categories, and/or female employees as a group

#	PaEE ISSUE	INITIATIVE	TIME FRAMES	ACCOUNTABILITY	UP DATE
3	Some staff returning from Parental Leave are disadvantaged by a change of employment status and/or position resulting in loss of pay, benefits and entitlements, career prospects, advancement, performance appraisal and pay progression. This has an impact on female staff whom are more likely than males to take Parental Leave.	Establish an approach/method to ensure follow up and liaison with staff during periods of parental leave, and process for identifying best possible return to work options that recognize previous roles/experience, conditions of employment and ongoing career aspirations.	Develop and implement approach by 12 December 2008. By December 2009, report back on changes in terms and conditions of those staff returning from parental leave in the period Dec 2008-09.	General Manager Workforce Development.	PLANNED
4	Variation in Social Work female starting salaries and female/male median salary within regions and between sites.	Investigate variations between sites and regions to identify if there are specific localized issues impacting on starting salaries for female social work staff.	Report back by 30 November 2008.	General Manager Workforce Development.	PLANNED
5	High turnover rate for female Psychologists and Therapists compared to males in same roles.	Inquiry to identify specific reasons for high rate of female turnover Psychologists and Therapists with strategies to address issues (including pay disparities where not related to turnover) and reduce turnover identified.	By 12 December 2008.	General Manager Workforce Development.	PLANNED

#	PaEE ISSUE	INITIATIVE	TIME FRAMES	ACCOUNTABILITY	UP DATE
6	Lower salary ranges for female dominated job categories.	All future job evaluations will include evaluations using the Equitable Job Evaluation tool (EJE) to inform job sizing.	From October 2008.	General Manager Workforce Development	IN PROGRESS

3. Participation

- Promote and enhance opportunities and broaden the range of participation within the Administration job category as a female dominated job category, along with ensuring the value of the skills, responsibilities, effort and other job components are reflected in the actual pay and benefits received.
- Ensure equity for women is achieved in senior and management job categories and/or position titles as measured by a better consistency with gender ratios within the overall organisation

#	PaEE ISSUE	INITIATIVE	TIME FRAMES	ACCOUNTABILITY	UP DATE
7	Administration is a predominantly female category treated as a semi skilled 'dead-end' role. It lacks career prospects and mentoring, support, benefits, and entitlements to training for advancement are limited. Access to work related courses and up skilling is limited.	Develop career pathways for administration support roles (from administration through to both senior administration and SWRA roles) with links to attainment of on the job learning opportunities and qualifications via PSTO.	Initiate within 3 months and report back on pathways and relevant qualification opportunities by 12 December 2008.	Manager Organisational Development.	IN PROGRESS

#	PaEE ISSUE	INITIATIVE	TIME FRAMES	ACCOUNTABILITY	UP DATE
8	Low rate of female progression from Social Worker into Practice Leader positions	<p>Promote the career pathways from Social Worker through to Practice Leader together with information relating to the specific development pathways.</p> <p>Review progression policies and criteria for participation in Advanced Practice, Supervision and Certificate in First Line Management to identify if there are barriers for participation of female staff e.g. delivery modes that might make attendance more difficult for those with child care responsibilities.</p>	<p>Initiate immediately with findings implemented by 30 August 2008.</p>	<p>Manager Organisational Development</p> <p>Manager Organisational Development</p>	IN PROGRESS
9	Lower rates of recruitment of females in the Senior Advisor/Analyst Role and Lead Advisor/Analyst job categories.	<p>Review selection tools to ensure approach does not indirectly discriminate against female applicants and where necessary implement changes.</p>	<p>By 24 February 2009.</p>	<p>General Manager Workforce Development</p>	IN PROGRESS
10	Participation/representation on special projects, secondments etc is lower rates for females.	<p>Establish Intranet based approach for publishing secondments and development opportunities, ensuring the information is available to all staff.</p> <p>Raise managers awareness of the various policies/procedures related to career development opportunities for staff.</p>	<p>By 31 July 2008</p> <p>Review overall effectiveness within 12 months.</p> <p>Ongoing</p>	<p>General Manager Workforce Development.</p>	IN PROGRESS

4. Respect and Fairness

- Promote and enhance a culture of respect in the working environment by addressing behaviors that are detrimental to positive interactions between staff such as 'bullying'.

#	PaEE ISSUE	INITIATIVE	TIME FRAMES	ACCOUNTABILITY	UP DATE
11	Improving the workplace environment	Ensure information on areas such as harassment, bullying, discrimination (including information for managers on addressing and resolving complaints) is available to all staff via the intranet and in manager and staff induction/orientation programmes.	Completed by 31 August 2008.	Manager Organisational Development	IN PROGRESS

5. Matters to be addressed through existing initiatives

- A number of issues identified during the Review are able to be addressed immediately as part of existing work programmes and initiatives. These are listed below with the relevant actions taken.

#	PaEE ISSUE	ACTION TAKEN	RESPONSE	RESPONSIBILITY FOR FUTURE MONITORING	UP DATE
1	Staff perceive the performance pay system to be arbitrarily and inconsistently applied and that it does not always reward competency.	Referred to Performance and Development System Design Team.	The new Performance and Development System removes the ability of managers to apply arbitrarily determined outcomes and sets out clear pay progression based on attainment of competency based development goals.	General Manager Workforce Development.	COMPLETED
2	High rate of fixed term agreements for female social workers has the effect of lowering the overall female starting salary distribution and salary distribution within the 25 th percentile range.	Referred to recruitment project to review appropriate use of fixed term employees and the application of correct terms and conditions to their employment.	This work is ongoing and is expected to be completed in August 2008 with guidelines for managers in the employment of fixed term and casual staff.	General Manager Workforce Development.	IN PROGRESS

#	PaEE ISSUE	ACTION TAKEN	RESPONSE	RESPONSIBILITY FOR FUTURE MONITORING	UP DATE
3	Female starting salary is lower than males in Social Work for both qualified and unqualified staff.	Referred to Performance and Development System Design Team.	Guidelines for Managers re the placement of new staff on CYF Remuneration Ranges will be completed by 30 August 2008.	General Manager Workforce Development to monitor changes in starting salaries over 18 month period with report back to Chief Executive on outcome.	IN PROGRESS
4	Work life balance and flexible working options are allocated inconsistently and variably resulting in disadvantage to some staff, particularly females.	Issues of work life balance and retention issues relating to an aging workforce to be included in development of CYF's Workforce Development Strategy.	Project team will note these issues for specific attention in strategy to be drafted by 12 December 2008. Also to be referred into wider MSD Work life Balance work.	General Manager Workforce Development.	IN PROGRESS
5	Ten social workers have been identified as being paid below the minimum rate of pay and 41 qualified Social Workers are paid below the qualified starting rate on the pay range.	Referred to the Manager HR Operations for payroll investigation of individual cases and identify and implement appropriate remedies immediately.	Pending the implementation of the translation process to the new performance development system, individuals identified will be reviewed to see if further corrective action is required (to be completed by 24 December 2007).	Manager Human Resource Operations	COMPLETED
6	A trend in the allocation of discretionary payments for males to be disproportionately represented relative to their CYF gender ratio.	Referred to the Manager Organisational Development for consideration of the appropriateness of the discretionary payments policy in relation to the new PDS.	Recommendation to discontinue the discretionary payments policy and instead ensure appropriate use of higher duties and special duties allowances	General Manager Workforce Development.	IN PROGRESS